



Sefydliad Ymchwil Cymdeithasol
ac Economaidd a Data Cymru
Wales Institute of Social and
Economic Research and Data

WISERD Research on Race and Ethnicity

Professor Sally Power

October 2020

The logo for WISERD, featuring the letters 'WISERD' in a white serif font on a dark purple rectangular background. A white diagonal slash is positioned between the 'W' and 'S'.

Sefydliad Ymchwil Cymdeithasol
ac Economaidd a Data Cymru
Wales Institute of Social and
Economic Research and Data

The Wales Institute of Social and Economic Research and Data (WISERD) is a national, interdisciplinary, social science research institute.

We have been designated by the Welsh Government as a national research centre. Using innovative approaches, our research spans the fields of economics, sociology, geography and political science.

We are a collaborative venture between five Welsh universities: Aberystwyth, Bangor, Cardiff, South Wales and Swansea – working together to improve the quality and quantity of social science research in Wales and beyond.

Our research effects change by influencing the development of policy and practice across a range of sectors.

A decorative graphic consisting of a series of purple dots arranged in a curved, fan-like pattern that originates from the bottom left and extends towards the top right of the page.

WISERD Research on Race and Ethnicity

Table of Contents

Background	3
Economic injustices	5
Cultural injustices	7
Political injustices	10
International research	12
Impact and engagement	14

Background

Discussions triggered by campaigns around the *Black Lives Matter* movement have prompted WISERD to reflect on our track record of research on the structural inequalities, unequal life chances and injustices associated with racism. WISERD has undertaken a significant amount of research on these inequalities, but they have perhaps not been as visible in our publications and other outputs as they might have been.

One of the reasons why our research on race and ethnicity is not always visible is because of the nature of WISERD's empirical research, much of which can be broadly characterised in terms of two traditions – 'political arithmetic' and 'locality studies'.

Within political arithmetic, the ethnicity and race of individuals is extracted as part of the secondary analysis of existing datasets. The virtue of this approach is that it reveals the wider structural patterning of inequalities across contexts and over time. However, while ethnicity is always considered where the data are available, it is often not highlighted, as it is treated as only one of a number of significant variables. And while much of the research may be theoretically informed by understandings of intersectionality, in practice the focus has been on interactions between variables.

It should also be noted that there are particular problems in exploring ethnic inequalities through this kind of quantitative analysis when the focus is solely on Wales – which is the case for a significant amount of WISERD's research. In Wales, the proportion of the population identifying as Black, Asian or minority ethnic (BAME) is too small – at under six percent – to undertake very robust statistical analysis. These difficulties are evidenced in a range of statistical reports from the Welsh Government, ONS, GIG, Public Health Wales and various think tanks. For example, a recent report on health and ethnicity approached the problem by using broad groups and focusing on the percentage of the population who do not define themselves as White British or Irish.¹ However, these broad groupings are not useful for research in areas such as education, where the differences in outcomes between students from different BAME groups are greater than the differences between BAME and white students. It is also unfortunately the case that in some of our international comparative research it has not been possible to explore issues of race and ethnicity – either because the categories are non-commensurate, or, as is the case with France and Germany, it is illegal to ask these kinds of questions.

One of the other kinds of research in which WISERD specialises is locality studies. Rather than isolate distinctive demographic variables, our research here is able to explore the lived experience of racism and the extent to which the legacy of colonialism permeates the culture and practices of everyday life within particular geographical areas. Again, though, issues of race and ethnicity may not always be highlighted. Partly this is because their salience will vary according to the characteristics of the locality. But it is also because it is often impossible to isolate which injustices/experiences are associated with race and ethnicity, and which with other differences, such as citizenship status, nationality and religious affiliation.

¹ [Ethnicity and health in Wales \(2015\)](#)

These complexities are very apparent in WISERD's research on migration.

Because of these limitations, this review and only aim to highlight the range of research that WISERD has already, or is in the process of, undertaking on these issues.

The review begins by outlining the framework through which we have organised the research before going on to highlight three different kinds of dimensions of inequality that respectively contribute to economic, cultural and political injustices experienced by black and minority ethnic populations within the British Isles. The review then provides a brief overview of WISERD research that has addressed issues of race and ethnicity in other countries. We also look at the extent to which WISERD research has sought not only to uncover these injustices but to work with community groups to challenge them. We conclude by briefly looking forward to the work of the current [ESRC-funded WISERD Civil Society Centre](#), which has a focus on civic stratification and citizen rights where the intersection with race and ethnicity is particularly salient.

Organising the research

We could have organised our research on issues of race and ethnicity in a number of different ways – by methodological approach (political arithmetic, locality study); by policy area (e.g. housing, education, criminal justice etc); by ethnicity (Asian, African-Caribbean etc.); or by stage of the lifecourse (childhood, labour market entry, old age). However, while all of these approaches are possible, they do not capture the complex and multi-dimensional nature of racial and ethnic inequalities. We have therefore organised our research through Nancy Fraser's² threefold³ categorisation of inequalities.

Economic injustices, Fraser argues, involve exploitation (having the fruits of one's labour appropriated for the benefit of others); economic marginalisation (being confined to undesirable, poorly paid work or having access to none); and deprivation (being denied an adequate material standard of living).

Cultural injustices, on the other hand, include cultural domination (being subjected to patterns of interpretation and communication that are associated with another culture and are alien and/or hostile to one's own); non-recognition (being rendered invisible by means of authoritative representational, communicative and interpretative practices); and disrespect (being routinely maligned or disparaged in stereotypic public cultural representations and/or in everyday life situations).

² Fraser, N. (2008) Reframing justice in a globalizing world. In K. Olson (Ed) *Adding insult to injury: Nancy Fraser debates her critic*. London: Verso.

³ Fraser's earlier iterations of the model (Fraser 1997) were built around a twofold distinction between cultural and economic injustices. She later added political injustice to the frame, which she argues cannot be reduced to either the cultural or the economic domain, but which is essential if what she calls 'participatory parity' is to be realised.

Political injustices are connected to economic and cultural injustices, which will inevitably limit people's capacity to engage in all kinds of civic and political activity. However, Fraser contends that political injustices can exist over and above economic and cultural ones. These injustices reside in the nature of the state's jurisdiction. They contribute to marginalisation and misrepresentation (whereby political decision rules wrongly deny some the right to participate in decision-making) and misframing (where some members and groups are deemed outside the legitimate political community).

We look at each of these dimensions of injustice and inequality in the following sections.

Economic injustices

WISERD's research has uncovered a number of ways in which Black and minority ethnic groups experience economic injustices. These include entry to the labour market, earnings and access to services, particularly within disadvantaged neighbourhoods.

Labour market inequalities

WISERD's *Anatomy of Economic Inequality in Wales*⁴ shows that young people of Bangladeshi and Pakistani ethnicity are disproportionately disadvantaged in the labour market in terms of both employment and earnings. There is also a gender dimension to this, particularly in relation to non-employment, which is far higher among women of Indian, Bangladeshi, Pakistani and Chinese ethnicity. The research also shows that the earnings of those of Bangladeshi or Pakistani ethnicity fell below two thirds of the UK median for full-time work. These two groups are also among those living on the lowest incomes. In-work poverty is again most prevalent among Asian households. Forthcoming research, funded by the Office of Manpower Economics, will examine the links between ethnicity and pay in the public sector.

WISERD researchers have also explored the complex relationship between self-employment and ethnicity across England and Wales, and particularly in relation to migrant groups.⁵ They note that self-employment has remained high for some established migrant groups, especially men born in Pakistan, and that this reflects a lack of suitable opportunities in paid employment and racial discrimination.

To a large extent, inequalities in employment can be explained by educational outcomes which are discussed more fully in the next section which looks at cultural disadvantage. But lower qualifications are only part of the story.

⁴ Davies, R. et al. (2011) [An Anatomy Of Economic Inequality In Wales: A Report prepared on behalf of the Wales Equality And Human Rights Commission](#). WISERD Research Reports Series WISERD/Rrs/002

⁵ Clark, K., Drinkwater, S., & Robinson, C. (2017). [Self-employment amongst migrant groups: new evidence from England and Wales](#). *Small Business Economics*, 48(4), 1047-1069.

Access to resources and services

There are also racial and ethnic inequalities in terms of access to housing. Homelessness in particular is more prevalent among some groups than others. A review of health and homelessness data has revealed problematic reporting of administrative data relating to BAME households.⁶ This raises questions about representation of BAME households in administrative data and therefore the policy responses that emerge in response to analysis of such data. WISERD research for Crisis⁷ has also illustrated the complexity of cataloguing issues of race and ethnicity in relation to services. To some extent there are generally lower levels of support needs amongst BAME homeless people relative to white British individuals. Nationality may be more significant, with households of eastern Europeans proving to have lowest support needs but a very high prevalence of homelessness.

WISERD researchers have also used spatial analytical tools to identify gaps in service delivery in Wales – gaps that disproportionately affect BAME individuals and their families. For example, WISERD has undertaken research on accessibility to sporting facilities in Wales.⁸ Software tools developed during the course of the research have been used by national sporting bodies to better understand and address social inequalities in accessibility for those groups, including some BAME communities, that traditionally have had poor levels of engagement in recreational activities.

Such outputs are being used to understand the use of facilities and current gaps in provision for some ethnic minority communities in urban areas of Wales. In addition, an on-going project with colleagues in Administrative Data Research Wales (ADR-Wales) is using these findings to examine associations between accessibility, sports participation, physical activity and health where factors such as ethnicity are being investigated in order to study the types of factors which impact on the take-up, and extent, of a wide range of sporting activities.⁹

⁶ Government Social Research (2015) *Review into the capability of the 'Secure Anonymised Information Linkage' (SAIL) Databank to provide data for the Social Services National Outcomes Framework for people who need care and support and carers who need support: Final Report*. Welsh Government.

⁷ Mackie, P. & Thomas, I. (2014) [Nations apart? Experiences of single homeless people across Great Britain. Crisis.](#)

⁸ Langford, M., Higgs, G. & Radcliffe, J. (2018) 'The application of network-based GIS tools to investigate spatial variations in the provision of sporting facilities', *Annals of Leisure Research*, 21(2), 178-198.

⁹ Poulidou, T., Lowe, S. & Higgs, G. (2019) ['Assessing the health impacts of adults' participation in sports: investigating the role of accessibility to sport facilities.'](#) *International Journal of Population Data Science*, 4(3) *Conference Proceedings for International Conference on Administrative Data Research 2019*.

The extent to which BAME groups experience economic inequalities is evident in WISERD's analysis of the quality of life in ethnically diverse neighbourhoods in EU15 countries based on the 2007 European Quality of Life Survey (EQLS).¹⁰ The findings confirm that material poverty is often combined with higher degrees of social exclusion in such neighbourhoods. The perceived quality of life is also lower in these areas and in general they have higher levels of social tension. From a policy point of view, this underlines the need for an integrated and comprehensive social and housing policy intervention in affected high-diversity neighbourhoods, with strong involvement of local communities.

Cultural injustices

WISERD research has revealed the unequal access and outcomes experienced by members of BAME groups in relation to the labour market and welfare services, such as housing and sporting facilities. These economic injustices both reflect and reinforce cultural injustices, where different cultures are seen as not only different but as deficient and even dangerous. The cultural injustices range from tacit assumptions, compounded by negative and stereotypical representations, to explicit acts of hostility. WISERD research has revealed these cultural injustices from different viewpoints – from gathering evidence of the views and attitudes towards BAME groups and individuals, as well as eliciting the experiences of BAME groups and individuals themselves.

Social processes of racial discrimination begin early in life. Educational issues that disproportionately affect BAME pupils are being highlighted in the work that we are currently conducting in the WISERD Education Data Lab,¹¹ such as examining the high number of Black students who are excluded from school.

Since the MacPherson Report highlighted the issue of institutional racism within the criminal justice system over 20 years ago, it has been acknowledged that minority ethnic individuals are disproportionately likely to be arrested by the police. WISERD research on ethnicity and custody indicates that children from BAME groups are more likely to receive a custodial sentence than their white counterparts. It is also the case that children from black and minority groups, and Muslim and non-Muslim children, do not experience custody in the same way. BAME, including Muslim boys, reported their experiences more negatively than their counterparts and have poorer access to the mechanisms of procedural justice such as the complaints system.¹²

¹⁰ Davies, R., Wilkins, C., Harrison, E., Sibley, E. & Owen, D. (2011) [Quality of life in ethnically diverse neighbourhoods](#). European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions.

¹¹ [WISERD Education Data Lab](#)

¹² Barn, R., Feilzer, M., & Hardwick, N. (2018). Black and minority ethnic boys and custody in England and Wales: Understanding subjective experiences through an analysis of official data. *Social Sciences*, 7(11), 226.

Over the years, the WISERD Education Multi-Cohort Study (WMCS)¹³ has asked young people a series of questions about their perspectives on a wide range of issues relating to race and ethnicity, as well as about the extent to which explicit racist comments are prevalent within schools and playgrounds. The WMCS has also revealed the subtle ways in which race and ethnicity shape young people's attitudes towards public figures.¹⁴

Attitudes towards race and ethnicity are often connected to fears about terrorism and migration. WISERD research has shown that these fears – and how they translate into racist practices – were exacerbated during the debates surrounding the 2016 referendum on UK membership of the European Union.¹⁵

WISERD's analysis of media coverage and migrants' experiences¹⁶ revealed how the outcome of the referendum engendered a sense of fractured nationhood in Wales. While Wales voted to leave the European Union, the regions of Ceredigion, Cardiff and Gwynedd voted to remain. A key point of persuasion in the media and Brexit campaign was migration, which was often associated with negative stereotyping of racial and religious minorities. Analysis of local print press media around migration examined the positioning of migrants and the dominant competing discourses in the three 'remain' regions. Additionally, interviews with migrants explored how they felt they were positioned by wider Welsh society and how the temporal shift between pre- and post-Brexit have impacted on their everyday experiences.

A WISERD collaboration between Wales Ethnic Youth Support Team (EYST) also created a space for young, ethnic minority women to voice their experiences after Brexit.¹⁷ This revealed how, for the women in the project, the fallout from the EU referendum has caused ongoing feelings of isolation and alienation - in similar ways to the emotional fallout of being a victim of a racist incident or hate crime - but felt on a larger scale.

A particular focus of WISERD research has been the extent to which attitudes towards BAME individuals and groups vary geographically. This is clear through the analysis of large scale survey data and locality-based qualitative research.

¹³ [WISERDEducation Multi Cohort Study](#)

¹⁴ Power, S., & Smith, K. (2017). 'Heroes' and 'villains' in the lives of children and young people. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 38(4), 590-602.

¹⁵ Guma, T., & Dafydd Jones, R. (2019). "Where are we going to go now?" European Union migrants' experiences of hostility, anxiety, and (non-) belonging during Brexit. *Population, Space and Place*, 25(1), e2198.

¹⁶ [Migration, Moral Panics and Meanings: Examining Historical Representations of Immigrants and Their Post-Brexit Impacts in Three Welsh 'Remain' Regions](#)

¹⁷ Pearce, S. & Muddiman, E. (2018) '[A space for the voices of young, BME women in the Brexit process](#)'. WISERD Blog.

Analysis of data from the British Social Attitudes Survey reveals statistically significant variations in attitudes towards asylum seekers within the UK.¹⁸ People living in London, the South East of England and Scotland display the most tolerant views. While these variations might be partly explained by the demographic characteristics of people in these areas (membership of BAME group, level of education), significant differences remain between rural and some urban areas, especially large cities.

These variations have been explored in further collaborative research with the universities of Glasgow and Sheffield on the relationships between Brexit politics, migration and aspects of multiculturalism in rural Scotland, Wales and England. Building on interviews with policy makers in these contexts, it is evident that race and racism can be viewed as part of the rural-Brexit relationship, and associated with the growing dependence of many rural communities on migrant populations.¹⁹

The extent to which public sentiments towards immigrants and immigration in Wales varies from other areas of the UK was further explored through the secondary analysis of the European Social Survey and Citizenship Survey. In general, regions such as the North and Midlands of England showed less favourable attitudes to immigrants than Scotland and London/South East England. In many cases, Wales shows a similar pattern to the Mid and North English regions. Certainly, comparing Scotland and Wales as devolved nations, the pattern is characterized more by one of difference than similarity between the two.²⁰

It is not necessarily the case that urban populations are always more positive about migration than rural communities. WISERD research on immigration in small towns in Ireland found evidence of 'rural cosmopolitanism' in which immigrants were welcomed and place-identity reframed in an inclusive way. However, these developments were precarious, and being destabilised by wider societal forces, including recession and growing Islamophobia.²¹ Of particular relevance here is research on the experience of Muslims in rural Wales.^{22 23}

¹⁸ Crawley, H., Drinkwater, S., & Kausar, R. (2019). [Attitudes towards asylum seekers: Understanding differences between rural and urban areas](#). *Journal of Rural Studies*, 71, 104-113

¹⁹ Neal, S., Gawlewicz, A., Heley, J. & Jones, R.D. (2019) [La campagna inglese non è un quadro di constable](#), *Revista Italiana Di Geopolitica*, 2465-1494,

²⁰ Mann, R. & Tommis, Y. (2012) [Public Sentiments Towards Immigration in Wales. Final Report for the Welsh Government](#). WISERD.

²¹ Woods, M. (2018) [Precarious rural cosmopolitanism: negotiating globalization, migration and diversity in Irish small towns](#), *Journal of Rural Studies*, 64, 164-176.

²² Jackson, L. and Jones, R.D. (2014) 'We'll keep a welcome'? Proximity, distance and hospitality towards migrants in Wales, *Contemporary Wales*. 27: 82-104.

²³ Jones, R.D. (2015) Mwslemaid yn y Gymru wledig: datgysylltiad, ffydd a pherthyn, *Gwerddon*, 19.

Political injustices

As is clear from the evidence cited above, members of black and minority ethnic groups suffer a range of economic and cultural injustices – and these are compounded by lack of representation in decision-making. This is most clear-cut for BAME migrants, and particularly for refugees and asylum seekers who are denied access to the formal mechanisms of political engagement. WISERD research has shown that individuals from BAME groups are also under-represented in other forms of civic and political participation.

These injustices are both reflected and reinforced through the framing of political discourse. WISERD has undertaken content analysis of how ethnic minorities are represented in political parties' campaigns for the Westminster (1964–2010) and Scottish, Welsh and Northern Irish elections (1998–2011).²⁴ The analysis reveals a significant increase in issue salience driven by parties of the left. This applies to both state-wide and meso-elections, thereby providing evidence of political reprioritisation in the wake of ethnic minority activism in the 1970s and 1980s. The new political opportunity structures afforded by devolution are shown to be leading to the territorialisation of policy. However, the analysis also reveals significant shortcomings, including parties' failure to adopt a systematic approach. The relationship between racial prejudice and the political behaviour of racial minorities is the focus of a forthcoming research project.

One reason for the lack of political engagement might stem from the fact that the legislature within the UK in general is predominately white. WISERD's analysis of the proportion of employees within either the Senedd or the Welsh Government reveals disproportionately few come from BAME groups. This research also reveals the frustration that civil society organisations representing BAME communities experience in getting support and influence.²⁵

Participation in civil society, even at a young age, varies according to ethnicity – although religious affiliation adds another layer of complexity. This complexity is evident in patterns of religious affiliation, ethnicity and club membership of young people. There is a strong relationship between religious affiliation and club membership, and particularly notable are the low levels of club membership among young Muslims in Wales. That this is not straightforwardly related to ethnicity is evident in the fact that Black students, who are predominantly Muslim, are also the highest 'joiners' of school clubs.²⁶

²⁴ Chaney, P. (2015) [Manifesto Discourse and the Substantive Representation of Ethnic Minorities: Analysis of UK State-Wide and Meso Elections, 1964-2011](#), *Parliamentary Affairs: A Journal of Representative Politics* (Oxford University Press/ Hansard Society) 68(1): 154–181.

²⁵ Chaney, P. (2015) "Getting Involved: Public Policy-Making and Political Life in Wales" Chapter 13, pp. 305-330, in C. Williams, N. Evans & P. O'Leary (Eds) [A Tolerant Nation? - Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales](#). Cardiff, University of Wales Press.

²⁶ Power, S. (2020) 'Young people's civic engagement and political participation'. In S. Power (Ed) *Civil Society through the Lifecourse*. Bristol: Policy Press.

A range of exclusionary processes mean that individuals from BAME groups are often under-represented in a range of other civil society organisations. Research on rural volunteering and community life has consistently highlighted the tendency for these activities to be disproportionately undertaken by white, older, middle class women, and with many institutions being largely unrepresentative of members from ethnic minorities.²⁷

WISERD research also shows that being a migrant is also negatively associated with trade union membership. Levels of membership among migrants are lower than those employees who were born in the UK, although levels rise as time spent in the UK increases. Low levels of membership are particularly apparent among migrants from EU accession countries, for whom union membership is approximately a third of the UK average.²⁸

Of course, while some of our research has highlighted the exclusionary dimensions of civil society, other research has shown the potential of various forms of community organisations to give BAME groups a voice. For example, research on local civil society responses in Aberystwyth, Mumbles and Splott to the refugee crisis emphasizes aspects of progressive localism in groups proactively seeking to welcome refugees.²⁹ However, it also highlights biases in the uneven response between the case studies and hidden counter-narratives within them.

Other research by WISERD has also explored the hidden value of community organisations in Wales - many of which try to address issues of race-based marginalisation and exclusion.³⁰

²⁷ See, for instance, Jones, L., Heley, J. and Yarker, S. (2020) 'Retiring into civil society'. In S. Power (Ed) *Civil Society through the Lifecourse*. Bristol: Policy Press.

²⁸ Davies, R., Drinkwater, S. & Owen, D. (2016) [Trade Union Membership among the Migrant Community](#). WISERD.

²⁹ Guma, T., Woods, M., Yarker, S. and Anderson, J. (2019) ['It's that kind of place here': solidarity, place-making and civil society response to the 2015 refugee crisis in Wales, UK, Social Inclusion, 7](#).

³⁰ Elliott, E., Todd, R. & Herbert, A. (2020 forthcoming) *The Hidden Value of Community Anchor Organisations*. WISERD.

International research

We have listed our research in international contexts separately here - not because minority ethnic communities in other contexts do not suffer economic, cultural and political injustices, but because the history of colonialism has led to these injustices taking very different forms.

Like WISERD research on Wales and the UK, our international research entails both the political arithmetic of cross-national comparisons and locality studies. It should be noted though that international comparisons are particularly challenging in the area of race and ethnicity as a result of historically-embedded differences in ethnic classifications, and different regulations on data collection.

Examples of contextually-specific research on processes of racial and ethnic stratification are listed below:

- Historical research on rural cosmopolitanism in Australia,³¹ examining how white supremacy is brought into being and how non-white stories (especially those of Chinese farmers) are written out of history.
- The outsourcing of low-paid labour intensive work in the global south. This work is predicated on global inequalities, which are inevitably linked to histories of colonialism and ongoing ethnic/racial inequality. WISERD research shows how ethnicity, race and religious intolerance continue to frame conditions on the ground, so that within sectors like garments, leather, footwear and domestic service, many layers of socio-economic discrimination thrive and are inextricably bound up in ethnicity, religion and caste.³²
- Urban refugee economies in Ethiopia: This research examined the economic contribution of urban refugee livelihoods to their host towns and cities. Race, ethnicity and nationality proved to be important factors in determining refugee inclusion in urban economies in Addis Ababa.³³
- Post-conflict urban livelihoods: This research explored the urban informal economy's critical role in poverty-reduction, peace-building, and economic recovery in post-crisis or conflict cities, through five case study cities. In the Karachi (Pakistan) case study, ethnic tensions proved to be a key driver of the conflict, intertwined with issues of land ownership, gangs and politics.³⁴

³¹ Woods, M. (2018) [Rural cosmopolitanism at the frontier? Chinese farmers and community relations in northern Queensland](#), c 1890 - 1920, *Australian Geographer*, 49, 107-131.

³² [COVID-19 lockdown and the needs of garment workers in Bangalore, India](#)

³³ Project website: [Urban refugee economies, Ethiopia](#)
Key publication: [Refugee economies: lessons from Addis Ababa](#)

³⁴ Project website: [Post-conflict urban livelihoods](#)
Key publication: [The informal economy in urban violence: Karachi-Pakistan](#)

WISERD has also contributed significant publications on the following issues: ethno-religious tensions in India and Bangladesh, and especially the plight of the Rohingya;^{35 36 37 38} the persecution of the Muslim Uighurs in China;³⁹ the intersectional inequalities of ethnicity and gender in Africa;⁴⁰ the position of the Roma in the former Yugoslavia;⁴¹ and children rights in the Occupied Palestinian Territories.⁴²

³⁵ Chaney, P. (2021) "Civil Society, Statelessness and Rights Denial: The Case of the Rohingya in Bangladesh" Chapter in N. Uddin *The Present with No Future: The Rohingya in the Place of Migration*, London & Delhi: Routledge.

³⁶ Chaney, P. and Sahoo, S. (2020) *Civil Society and Citizenship in India and Bangladesh*, Delhi, London: Bloomsbury

³⁷ Chaney, P. and Sahoo, S. (2020) Civil Society and the Contemporary Threat to Religious Freedom in Bangladesh, *Journal of Civil Society*.

³⁸ Chaney, P. (2019) [India at the Crossroads? Civil Society, Human Rights and Religious Freedom: Critical Analysis of CSOs' Third Cycle Universal Periodic Review Discourse 2012-2017](#), *International Journal of Human Rights*, 24(5): 531-562,

³⁹ Chaney, P. (2018) [Civil Society, Human Rights and Religious Freedom in the People's Republic of China: Analysis of CSOs' Universal Periodic Review Discourse](#), *International Journal of Human Rights*,

⁴⁰ Chaney, P. (2016) Mind the Gap? Gender Equality and Civil Sphere in Africa: Analysis of Policy Discourse on the Beijing Declaration 2003-15, *Review of African Political Economy*. 43(150), 608-629.

⁴¹ Chaney, P. (2016) [Comparative analysis of State and Civil Society Discourse on Human Rights Implementation and the Position of Roma in the former Yugoslav Space](#), *Ethnopolitics*, 16(5): 431-449, Routledge T & F, ISSN 1744-9057 (Print), 1744-9065 (Online) (1,265 downloads)

⁴² Chaney, P. (2020) Civil Society Perspectives on Children's Rights in the Occupied Palestinian Territories, *Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*.

Impact and engagement

Alongside WISERD's research which seeks to uncover inequalities associated with race and ethnicity, WISERD researchers are actively engaged with those governmental and civil society organisations trying to address these inequalities.

This engagement takes a number of forms – from 'high level' discussions with policy-makers to work with 'grass roots' organisations. Examples of these different types of collaboration and co-production are provided below:

- Invited contribution to the Lammy Review of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) Representation in the Criminal Justice System, May 2016. ⁴³
- Collaboration with North Wales Police on strategies to engage with the Muslim community in North Wales.^{44 45}
- The REACH2XL in which WISERD in partnership with diverse local authority and third sector stakeholders, supported minority ethnic young people in the Butetown area of Cardiff who were at risk of not participating in employment, education or training. It focused on developing the skills, knowledge and confidence they needed to access and thrive in further and higher education.
- 'Rural Hate and Hostility' Stakeholder Workshop in Aberystwyth with participants from Welsh Government, local authorities, Citizens Advice, Victim Support Cymru, Ethnic Youth Support Team (EYST) and Networking for World Awareness of Multicultural Integration (NWAMI) discussing research on hate crime and racial hostility in rural Wales.
- Stakeholder event 'How Has Civil Society in Wales Responded to the Refugee Crisis?' in Cardiff with representatives from Cardiff Council, Wales Strategic Migration Partnership, Swansea City of Sanctuary, Oasis Cardiff and Aberaid.
- Providing Action Research training for young Muslim women in conjunction with the Ethnic Youth Support Team (EYST) in Cardiff and Swansea.⁴⁶

⁴³ [Lammy review: final report](#)

⁴⁴ Feilzer, M.Y. and Javed, F. (2011). *Engaging the Muslim Community in North Wales: A Police Perspective*. Final Report to North Wales Police.

⁴⁵ Feilzer, M.Y. and Javed, F. (2010). *Understanding the Demographics of the Muslim Community in North Wales*. Final Report to Anglesey County Council and North Wales Police.

⁴⁶ WISERD (2018) '[EYST Wales volunteers learn community research methods from WISERD researchers](#)' *WISERD Blog*.

- WISERD, in collaboration with the Legal Education Foundation, supports the Wales Civil Society Forum on Brexit which seeks to empower organisations to have a voice in the Brexit process, and particularly those representing BAME communities. The Forum has revealed a lack of BAME engagement and representation of those communities' concerns and issues throughout the Brexit process. The Forum has also invited engagement through third sector organisations to make their concerns around Brexit heard.

Looking forward, within the new [WISERD Civil Society Centre](#) there is a general concern for citizenship rights and inequality that encompasses the impact of racism on everyday lives. Specifically, the new research programme will undertake comparative international research on the rights of migrant groups, on inequalities arising from new technologies, on the rights of children and the relationship between polarization, political participation and forms of identity.

The Centre will look at the influence of elites within civil society and the absence of BAME groups from decision making. Our work on labour markets, accessibility (across a number of services) and educational outcomes will provide insights into categorical inequalities based on race and ethnicity.

Alongside these enduring concerns, WISERD has adapted some of its research projects to address the impact of Covid-19 on civil society and civic stratification. In so doing the research will also focus on unequal impacts of both the virus and associated economic crises on Black, Asian and minority ethnic groups.